



The Philosophy in Schools Association of NSW invites NSW secondary students to submit an essay to our fifth annual 2023 Essay Competition, proudly sponsored by the **Royal Society of NSW Southern Highlands**.

This packet contains the competition rules (below), the stimulus material, the marking criteria, and submission form.

1. Submissions will be judged by one or more (unpaid) academic philosophers.
2. The three best will be selected, and plus honourable mentions for up to three more deserving entries.
3. Awards will be presented at the Ethics Explorations Day, 14 June at Rosebank College

Competition Rules

1. Entrants must be in Years 10-12 and in full time secondary students at a NSW school (public, private or Catholic). (Students in higher education may not enter.)
2. Each entrant may submit one essay only addressing the set philosophical topic.
3. Essays must not exceed 2000 words. (Please indicate a word count on the front page.)
4. The essay must be entirely the student's own work. Any form of unfair practice (including plagiarism) will disqualify the entrant from the competition.
5. Submissions must be in the form of Word documents in the following format:
 - a. Font size: 12 in a typeset of Calibri, Courier or Times New Roman
 - b. Line spacing: 1.5 between lines
 - c. Italics should be used for foreign/specialist words, bold may be used for emphasis.
 - d. Footnotes should be used, rather than endnotes, if they are required.
 - e. Do not include your name in your submission.
6. The submission must be accompanied by a completed Submission Form which must be signed by the entrant, one of their teachers and a parent/caregiver. (The form can be found on Page 6 of this document.) The submission form and essay should be attached separately to a single email, sent to philosophyinschoolsnsw@gmail.com
7. No more than 3 submissions can be made per school.
8. Submissions received after the due date (1 May at 5.00pm AEST) will not be considered.



The Philosophy in Schools Association of NSW
2023 Essay Competition

Stimulus:

Should there be restrictions on free speech?

Consider these two contrasting views:

- **In favour of unrestricted free speech:** Unrestricted free speech is morally and socially beneficial because it promotes individual autonomy, supports democracy and prevents oppression. It's also epistemically beneficial because even in the case of controversial, offensive or false views, it's better for them to be debated openly to allow for evaluation and critique, than for them to be suppressed and potentially pushed underground.
- **In favour of restrictions:** Some kinds of speech are morally and socially harmful (eg hate speech) and/or epistemically harmful (e.g., misinformation). The harms of allowing such discourse outweigh any possible benefits, and restrictions on these forms of speech are justified for the good of individuals and society.

Critically evaluate these views and defend your own view on this topic.

Here are some background resources you may find helpful:

UNHDR: <https://www.un.org/en/about-us/universal-declaration-of-human-rights>

United Nations World Press Freedom Day

3 May: <https://www.un.org/en/observances/press-freedom-day/background>

Sandel, Michael, 2015. "Making a case for democracy", *The Harvard Gazette*:
<https://news.harvard.edu/gazette/story/2015/01/making-a-case-for-democracy/>

Sandel, Sandel, 2018. "Global Philosopher: Should there be any limits to free speech?":
<https://www.bbc.co.uk/programmes/p069dx6m>. BBC Podcast (42 mins.)

van Mill, D., 2016. "Explainer: What is free speech?" *The Conversation*.
<<https://theconversation.com/explainer-what-is-free-speech-64797>>

Chellappah, Nevin, 2022, "Mill, Free Speech and Social Media", *Philosophy Now*
https://philosophynow.org/issues/151/Mill_Free_Speech_and_Social_Media

van Mill, D. , 2021, "Freedom of Speech", *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2021 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2021/entries/freedom-speech/>.

Gloser, S., Godwin, E. J. and Mota, R., 2022. "Twitter and Elon Musk: why free speech absolutism threatens human rights" *The Conversation*.
<<https://theconversation.com/twitter-and-elon-musk-why-free-speech-absolutism-threatens-human-rights-193877>>

Philosophy Bites podcast (17 minutes): Thomas Scanlon on Free Speech
https://philosophybites.libsyn.com/tim_scanlon_on_free_speech



The Philosophy in Schools Association of NSW Essay Competition

Marking Criteria

Submissions will be evaluated based on their critical engagement, synthesis of ideas, and written expression using the criteria below:

Range	Criteria
A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Outstanding, perceptive and sophisticated response which exhibits coherence and cohesion • Engages critically with key thinkers, arguments and issues in this field • Expresses perceptive ideas with clarity / skill / originality
B	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Effectively explores / discusses the philosophical problem of identity • Shows understanding of key thinkers, arguments and issues in this field • Expresses ideas effectively in relation to the stimulus
C	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides a discussion and/or description of the problem of identity • Makes relevant reference to key thinkers, arguments and issues in this field • Expresses ideas competently
D	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Attempts to discuss the concept of identity • Shows some awareness of thinkers, arguments and issues in this field • Expresses ideas in a variable manner
E	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Describes or refers to the topic 'identity' • Shows limited awareness of relevant thinkers, arguments and issues • Expresses ideas in a confused or limited manner



The Philosophy in Schools Association of NSW
2023 Essay Competition
proudly sponsored by the Royal Society of NSW Southern Highlands

Submission form

School _____ Year group _____

Student name _____

Teacher's name _____

The signatures below constitute a pledge that all of the writing is the student's own work, with the exception of those portions which are properly documented.

Student signature _____ Date _____

Teacher's signature _____ Date _____

We the undersigned give permission for essays to be published by the Philosophy of Schools Association of NSW and/or the Royal Society of the Southern Highlands in print newsletters and/or online.

Student signature _____ Date _____

Student's Parent name _____

Student's Parent signature _____ Date _____

We the undersigned give permission for the student's name and image to be circulated in print newsletters and/or online

Student signature _____ Date _____

Student's Parent name _____

Student's Parent signature _____ Date _____